

A MEETING
OF THE UNIVERSITY FACULTY SENATE
WEDNESDAY, OCTOBER 12, 2016

1. CALL TO ORDER

Speaker Alex Susskind: "We would like to start by consent item. We want to approve the faculty [minutes](#) from our last meeting. And so by consent, I would like to move that we approve the minutes. All in favor? Okay. Opposed? Okay. Any abstentions? Without further ado, approved. Charlie has some faculty matters to discuss."

2. DEAN OF FACULTY MATTERS

Dean Charlie Van Loan: "I will try to be brief. We have a packed agenda. Two ad hoc committees have been formed and will work on two pretty important problems.

"The first one is on the calendar. As you remember, about five years ago, there was a committee. We have a new calendar. Part of the deal was we reassess it at this point. And so the plan is to gather data sort of in the fall, solicit campus opinion, and then sort of deliberate in early spring. And everything I say is on the web, for more details and so on.

"There are really two big issues, and they sort of revolve around the spring.

Everything is up for grabs, but the two big issues are positioning of the February

break. It is too early. And in play is actually the opportunity to move the entire spring semester back, say, two weeks. That means moving commencement back two weeks. These are the two main issues that will surface.

“Again, the timeline is to show up here in, say, March or April or earlier with a plan, and then we vote on it in May. It goes to the provost, who then decides.

The other ad hoc committee -- I can answer questions as I go along or at the end.

“Start two weeks earlier. Yeah. One complaint, student jobs in the summer is the high point of that argument.

“Committee's been formed to look into the transition to emeritus. There is tremendous variation across the colleges. We would like to get that clarified, so to speak. The other thing is when you look in the faculty handbook, there's all kinds of guidelines for assistant to associate, associate to full. Lets write two paragraphs on full to, or whatever to emeritus. So the idea is to get some consistency. It is kind of a mess, that whole scene right now. So there's the charge and so on.

“Again, the same kind of timeline, gather data, opinion in the fall, and then try to come to some conclusion in the spring. It will show up back here later in the spring.

"A couple of little items here. We have a dozen committees. I'm just highlighting three of them and what they are doing. The last meeting, there was discussion about what is a credit hour. That is under deliberation by the EPC.

"There was discussion with the provost on one of our committees that oversees the process of program review. We looked at it and we talked to the provost about it. The idea is to speed up the timeline. It should be one year, but some of them drag on longer than that. So things have been put in place for a more equally informative review, but trying to enforce the timeline a little better.

"And then there are two student issues that are now sitting in the Academic Freedom and Professional Status of the Faculty Committee; one from the undergraduates, which has to do with the inclusive learning experience. Lots of items in there. And then the graduate student one that's concerned with supervisor-student relationships.

"Again, I hope to bring this up in December, where we can begin to talk about it and it will spill over into the spring.

"And finally, just three other little things coming down the pike. The other assemblies are looking at the possibility of a smoke-free campus. It might come our way. This is just a heads up. There's a bureaucracy working group that's designed to -- faculty and staff, to streamline the operations. And we are looking for participating departments. And four have stepped up, which is very good,

and that operation will be launched. We will look at it later in the year to see how successful it is.

“Finally, you may know from reading, that there was a report out now on campus neutrality by 2035, look to having a presentation in November. That is it, but I can answer any questions about these things. Okay, back to Alex.”

Speaker Susskind: “The next item is we're going to be hearing from vice presidents Joanne Destefano and Ryan Lombardi about various issues surrounding campus safety, so we've allocated 20 minutes for discussion.

“Please come on up.

“And when we ask questions, what we need to do today is you need to come up to one of the microphones and speak your name very clearly and your department, so that we can get the information on the transcript. Last meeting, we missed a lot of that because we didn't have the mic's set up, so that's just a change, so please be aware of that. I will remind you, in the event that you forget. This mic is live.”

3. AN UPDATE ON VARIOUS ISSUES THAT SURROUND CAMPUS SECURITY, VICE PRESIDENTS JOANNE DESTEFANO AND RYAN LOMBARDI

Vice President DeStefano: “Good afternoon, everyone, and thank you for having us. You may be wondering why I'm here. Back in October, Cornell University Police and Environmental Health and Safety moved their reporting line to report

to me. There is a police installation where new officers have been installed going on at the same time, so I have offered to talk to you today.

“So I have four questions that I think we were given to answer for you, so Ryan and I will share our responses to these questions, and then hopefully we can have a nice dialogue about it.

“So the first question was: Are there heightened efforts to keep campus secure.

“So there's four things that we are doing. One is, after the last stabbing, we have increased the number of uniformed police patrols and we are keeping them working the extra hours until further notice. Another thing is we've increased the number of campus blue light escort teams around campus to help with students.

“And then the next two, I think, are going to be the most significant. We have been working for the past year to implement police body cameras and vehicle cameras, and we have figured out the majority of the policy. We have spoken to the various governance groups. I think hopefully someone from here was a representative when we were talking about it. And the goal is to have them in place on all the police by the start of the spring semester.

“The body cameras are on order. The company will be coming in, providing training probably in December. And so when we think about some of these

incidents, particularly the fatal stabbing on campus, to have that body camera right on the police, I think, will help in some of these investigations.

“And then the other one, related to video also, is that we have a program to try to increase the number of video cameras on campus. When we first started putting video cameras on campus, people were afraid we were impacting people's privacy, but I think as time has gone on, people realize the cameras on campus are a benefit; and there were not very many in that Ho Plaza area, where that fatal stabbing. So those are things that we think could have significance going forward.

“One of the other questions that was asked is: In retrospect, is there anything that we can share regarding the weaknesses in our protocols.

“One thing you have to keep in mind is an event that happens off-campus is not under Cornell Police jurisdiction. So only Cornell campus university-owned facilities are Cornell Police jurisdiction.

“So of the three stabbings since last August, two were actually off-campus. So when you are asking about our protocols, we only have the one to look at, and that is the one that actually happened on campus.

“Part of the standard procedures, whenever there's an event, is that there's a debriefing afterwards, where everyone goes over the events, what happened, and try to come up with things that could be done better.

"I don't have any specifics of what could be done, but what they look at is the speed of taking care of both the victim or trying to catch the assailants, if you will.

"Another area that we will be taking a look at is the party protocols. Ryan, you want to talk about that?"

Vice President Lombardi: (off mic) "Approval by about eleven departments on campus, including Safety, police, et cetera. Then there are specific extra guidelines for late night events, which the stabbing that resulted in a fatality would absolutely fall in that category, since it was from 10:00 p.m. to 2:00 a.m., where there's a requirement of police presence and security monitors and all those types of things, all of which were present at the event in question.

"So we have this very robust process. All the steps that we are aware of were followed in this case. It is important for me to say that this incident happened after the event. By all accounts, the event itself went fine, it was a late night event. That is not uncommon for us to have late night events on campus, by any stretch. We try to do that to promote behaviors and supportive environments on our campus that would be positive. Obviously, this wasn't the case after this event that happened.

"So having said that, we are working with our staff and the students and student organizations, but also our staff in campus activities and in Greek life to examine

and just make sure we're very comfortable with our protocols and also that we are applying all our protocols in every step along the way when we do have late night events, because we know that we are going to continue to have them. It is important we provide that space on this campus, but that we do so in a safe manner as possible."

Vice President DeStefano: "Another question was: Can you talk about the campus-wide alert system, how does it work, what triggers it and how are the messages comprised.

"So there are two types of alerts: There is a Cornell alert, which is like an emergency mass notification, and then there's a crime alert, which is an informational alert. Both types of alerts are prescribed by the Clery Act, the Clery law, which is the campus crime statistics act, and the emergency notification message is activated by the Cornell Police.

"When that message goes out, it's providing instruction for something. It could be as the example with the latest stabbing, there was concern about west campus, and so the instruction was to seek shelter.

"It could be the people who receive this -- our e-mail messages go out to everybody. That is automatic. Any faculty, staff or student receive an e-mail message. To receive a phone or a text message, you have to sign up, and so we encourage everyone to sign up for the phone and text message.

“And then, depending on the situation, it's possible that sirens could be used for that type of an alert. The actual message has to be 144 characters. So trying to get sufficient information about whatever the incident is and what action needs to be taken is within 144 characters.

“And again, at this point, it's an emergency. The CU police are the people that craft the message, determine that a message should go out. At the same time, they are actually handling phone calls and other radio transmissions.

“So it could also be just a weather notice, a thunderstorm coming, to power down computers. So it's types of activities that need to take an action or that they are asking people to take an action.

“The other type of alert is called a crime alert, and it's a timely warning and, again, provided by Cornell police, about an awareness of something that's happened.

“And again, this is prescribed by the Clery Act of what we need. Again, these go out to all current students, faculty and staff and affiliates via e-mail, and these alerts are posted on the Cornell University information web site. You don't have to be enrolled to receive these alerts. You will automatically receive the alerts.

“So when a Cornell police is handling a situation, the first thing they have to do is take care of the victim and the assailants. And then, once that's taken care of, then they think about the communication. Whenever there's an incident during

that emergency period, it's Cornell Police who provides the communication to campus.

“So then the last question that was asked was: Why did it take so long for the notification in the last stabbing.

“So one of the things you have to keep in mind is this was an incident that happened off-campus, so the call would have likely have gone to the Ithaca Police. So by time the information got to Cornell, there needed to be enough information in the alert to be able to send out to the rest of campus.

“We know now that last stabbing happened at 7:43, and we know that the notification went out at 8:32. So part of the protocol review will be to determine okay, what time did IPD know; and then work back. Okay, that was how many minutes after the actual incident? Because they usually determine the time of the incident post the event. And then how much information did they give the Cornell Police to be able to provide the alert?

“So again, because IPD had the jurisdictional oversight of that particular case, they can control the information. And there's no legal requirement for IPD to share the information with Cornell Police. The good news is that the two police departments have a good relationship, they do share information.

“Had more information been known by Cornell Police, perhaps they wouldn't have needed to send out the notification. They were not aware that it was an

isolated incident at the time of the incident. That is why they sent out the west campus notification. After the fact, they learned that it was a targeted, isolated case; but in precaution, they sent out the alert, just to protect our campus.

“I just want to add one last thing, then we can open it up to any type of question you have. On the fatal stabbing, while that happened on the Cornell campus, we aren't staffed with homicide investigators; so while Cornell Police was involved in that incident, Ithaca Police is responsible for the actual investigation.

“The investigation is very active. You can see on what limited video we have that there were lots of video, people holding cameras, their phones with video. They are still asking for more video. They need to make sure they have a solid case before they move it forward, so they're still asking for more video, so that they can put an air-tight case together before they go out and try to make some type of a statement and then find out that they don't have enough evidence to take the case all the way forward.”

Vice President Lombardi: “Yeah, I would just add on that point, I know it's been frustrating internally, certainly, but also externally to our external constituents, parents, et cetera, that more information is not being shared about that, but it's very important for the police to preserve the integrity of the investigation at this point. It is very active, very aggressive, but it does create a frustration and a

tension that more information is not out there in that regard. It is hard to be patient when that kind of thing happens.”

Vice President DeStafano: “So we're open for questions.”

Speaker Susskind: “Please remember to state your name and your department very clearly.”

Senator Richard Bense, Department of Government: “I have a couple questions about protocol with the fatal stabbing. It is my understanding there were negotiations between the campus police and the event organizers about security for that event. And the first part of this question is more or less a comment, which is I wonder why there are negotiations over security between the campus police, who are professionals in this, and campus organizers, who probably are not; but the second part of the question is who conducted these negotiations and who approved that arrangement?

“And the second question is, it is also my understanding that at the very end of the event, the officer who was there called for another officer to come, and would you explain why that first officer, who had been in attendance at the event, what was the situation that motivated that officer to call for the second one to come?”

Vice President Lombardi: “I will take the first part of that. I am not aware of negotiations between the event organizers and the police. I know when an event

is registered, that they have to get approval from the police about what type of security is needed, based on the type of event.”

Senator Bense: “It is in two places. One is, we were directed to a faculty site that says these things are negotiated. That is when I asked the question. So it does say negotiations.

“And the other part, I won't report it, a conversation, but is with one of your people that said there were negotiations. I can do that afterwards, but I don't want to do it in public, but it certainly is one of your responsible officers.”

Vice President Lombardi: “I would appreciate hearing that in private afterwards, so I could follow up on that. I think my impression is that "negotiation" is probably the wrong word, if that's posted somewhere. The students submit -- in a student event, they submit what the event's going to look like, then the police say this is what we need to staff this with. This is the appropriate level of police presence or other said presence that you have to have there.

“Now, I do know, in fairness, that a number -- that's very costly to do that, so I know I have worked with student organizations who have difficulty finding money to cover that expense. I was just speaking to an organization about this the other day, but I have never heard of that being negotiation. So I would very

much like to talk with you afterwards to get a little more detail on that privately.

That would be terrific. I don't know on the second part of that --"

Vice President DeStefano: "I am not aware of any using the term negotiation either, but are you referring to whether there's a need for a police presence at an event, and that's determined in advance of the event? Is that what you're asking or saying?"

Senator Bensch: "Again, my -- this is negotiated in part to the way that Ryan is describing it, the event organizers want to minimize costs. The campus police then negotiate the security, and that that is the basis of the negotiation. That is the way it was described to me. So the event organizers usually have a vested interest in reducing the amount of security, and that is the negotiation that takes place.

"Who approves that final step?"

Vice President Lombardi: I am looking at the registration form for this event right now, and it went through and was approved by all those eleven departments, including CU Police, Environmental Health and Safety, Transportation, our student activities office, all the way through as they laid out, so that plan.

"So I would like to follow up on that, and if there is some language on the web site that talks about negotiation, my impression is that's probably not the

appropriate way that goes out, but it sounds like you have heard otherwise; so again, I would like to get a little more detail on that.”

Vice President DeStefano: “Then the second part of your question, I don't know all the details. What I have heard is that there was a mass group of people that were coming out of the event all at the same time and, because of that, the police officer asked for a second police person in the area.”

Associate Dean of Faculty Chris Schaffer, Biomedical Engineering. “Ryan, this question is primarily for you, mostly about your impression of student attitudes about these events currently, so I would be curious, your impressions on students' feeling of safety and issues like that on campus.

“And then for underrepresented minority groups, the fraternity here was one. Do they feel they have been targeted or not? And if there are problems, are there steps your office or others you're aware of are doing to try to rectify this?”

Vice President Lombardi: “Thanks, Chris. I appreciate you bringing that up. Obviously, this is very unsettling for many students on our campus, and faculty and staff alike. And I appreciate -- so one of the elements here that makes this very difficult is this is a historically African-American fraternity. The difficult part in that is those organizations don't have other locations by which to hold events, like predominantly -- historically white fraternities, who have these large

houses and places where they can have social events, and they do that on a very regular basis.

“These other chapters, which are typically much smaller in size, don't have that luxury, unfortunately, and so they rent space or they book space, like space at the Memorial Room in Willard Straight, where this took place. They often invite peers from other neighboring schools, because it's very important to develop community, especially in communities of color, where there's small numbers of population at Ithaca. It is important for them to develop those communities, so it's also very common for them to invite peers from other institutions in that regard.

“The students I have spoken to, I will say, especially are students of color, and particularly are African-American students, very much did feel targeted in this sense, because they were very worried that there would be a perception that this, because it was an African-American fraternity and that event, that that would somehow be linked to a problem with their fraternity or the way they're holding their events or some of those kind of things, when again, all senses are the event went very well and went okay, as it has for many years as an annual event. It was afterwards, and there was allowed large crowd dispersing, as there often is in Collegetown, at that area on a given night; and then obviously, a very horrible thing happened to a young person.

“So that community in particular is feeling very troubled by this, and I spent a lot of time with them to try to think about how we can continue to support them on this campus and also promote safety. We had very good conversations. I appreciate you bringing that up.”

Senator Wojciech Pawlowski, Plant Biology” “So after the last off-campus study, there was an official statement from the administration the very same evening, if I remember correctly. After the previous fatal stabbing, I think it took two days. I wonder if there was a reason for that, and if there is some kind of a procedure, how those communications are handled.”

Vice President Lombardi: “Sure. I’ll address that. So I sent a statement out within hours of the fatal stabbing. I sent it to students, vice president for student life, so my main constituency is students. So as we reflected on that incident, it wasn’t a university message, like President Rawlings’ message on the second one, that on the first one he sent several days later, because I had sent my message out very quickly to students on that Sunday morning. So I think that was a lesson learned and a reflection after the fact that my message was only reaching students in that case. So thank you.”

Senator Risa Lieberwitz, ILR: “I wanted to raise a concern about -- sounds like there’s actually a plan in place to increase video cameras.”

Vice President DeStefano: “There is a goal.”

Senator Lieberwitz: "Okay, well, I don't know who set the goal and where it comes from exactly, but there are obviously, as you pointed to, concerns about that, that we don't respond to something that's a serious issue with a response that actually is not the appropriate response and that intrudes into privacy and civil liberties issues."

Vice President DeStefano: "So what we've been doing is we have a map of the campus, and we're looking at areas where there have been higher crime committed, so those are the areas that will be a priority to make sure there's sufficient cameras. The cameras aren't manned. It isn't like somebody's watching them on a regular basis; however, they have become very valuable, if there is an incident, and you can go back and check the tape."

Senator Lieberwitz: Yeah, I mean obviously, one of the concerns has to also do with protests, that some of the same places you may have cameras are also places where protests take place. So if there's going to be consideration of increasing video cameras, then I'd really like to see that considered by appropriate committees from student governance bodies, faculty governance bodies, as well as University Assembly, because this touches everybody in that way, as opposed to being told this is being considered and it's going to happen."

Vice President DeStefano: "Thank you."

Senator Tim DeVoogd, Psychology. "I am also one of the chairs of the Campus Hearing Board, and several times over the last few years, I've been involved in cases where apparently things built up fairly slowly, and the students that were involved, nobody ever thought of calling the police.

"And so just a suggestion; that if you could have a program that says that there are occasions where, even if nothing violent has happened, it's still a good idea to call the police, just to disperse everyone, and perhaps with some assurance that in a situation like that, nobody is going to get arrested, nobody's going to be referred to the judicial administrator. It is just a way where the people there themselves don't feel like they have to handle it themselves."

Vice President Lombardi: "I appreciate that comment. If I could respond briefly and somewhat anecdotally to that, I spent a lot of time with the students who attended that event on that particular evening, and they have said listen, we've gone to events before where we had that notion that this maybe was just suddenly escalating and that it might not end well.

"To a tee, every single student I spoke to that evening said completely not the vibe that night in this event and didn't get that tone or that sense at all. But I do appreciate that, because I think that's a very good reminder to students that take some role, if they do feel that escalating at any point, to make a call and get that support. I appreciate that."

Vice President DeStefano: "Yeah, I agree."

Speaker Alex Susskind: "So let's move on to the next portion of the meeting. We have Jeff Doyle. He is going to present the resolution about renaming the Plantations. Do you have anyone else with you?"

"Okay, you guys can all come up. Great. We allocated 20 minutes for this discussion."

4. RESOLUTION TO REBRAND THE CORNELL PLANTATIONS - SUPPORT DOCUMENT FROM THE CALS DEAN AND THE CORNELL PLANTATIONS DIRECTOR – MORE DETAILED RATIONALE

Senator Jeff Doyle: "You guys want to come down and be here, ready to go? The plan is for me to present the resolution, and then the director of Plantations, Christopher Dunn, will then take questions. You are going to make a short presentation?"

"And then Alan Collmer was asked to represent some dissenting voices that were collected by the dean of the college of Ag and Life Sciences.

"So this is a group of sponsors. I contacted people I knew and asked them to take a look at it. And 15 people, including myself, were in favor of the resolution. This is a summary of the resolution that you have probably seen, the actual resolution itself.

"And basically, a couple points I want to make is first of all, there's been a process going on to look at this issue for a long time; for twelve years, in fact.

And that process was then ramped up in 2014, when Christopher Dunn became

the director of plantations. So there's a long-standing issue with the name Plantations.

“As Christopher's probably going to tell us, the name has really lived up to the expectations that Liberty Hyde Bailey had for this organization, this entity, when he proposed naming it Plantations in the first place. In fact, what has happened, essentially much of that vision has been realized by the College of Ag and Life Sciences in totality, rather than just the Plantations.

“And so Plantations, the name itself is not even actually botanically a particularly good name, because the definition of a plantation in a botanical sense is it's a monoculture used for industrial growing of crop plants and things like that. That does not capture what the Plantations is either.

“So the other issue, of course, is the issue that comes up somewhere in here -- this one here, Black Students United wanting to have the name changed because of the other connotation of Plantations, which obviously is a sensitive issue, particularly right now. But what I do want to convey is that the process of wanting to rename Plantations predates that episode, this demand or request by Black Students United, so that's not really the focus of this in many respects, though it is certainly an ancillary issue.

“Finally, this whole process of looking at stakeholders or talking to stakeholders and getting input has resulted in 70% to 75% of the people contacted in surveys

suggesting that the name Plantations was not appropriate really for this entity and that some renaming should be done.

“So that's really the basis for this, and I think at that, I'll turn it over to Christopher, then.”

Professor Christopher Dunn, Cornell Plantations Director: “Well, thank you very much, Jeff. Is this live? Yes, okay.

“Some of the things that I will say repeat what Jeff just said, but I think they bear repeating. So in fact, this idea of examining the name goes back at least ten years, and it was thwarted at that time. Doesn't seem to be the right time. Then when I was hired, Kathryn Boor, the dean of the College of Ag and Life Sciences, we talked about this, and we agreed that it was time now to take a look, not just at the name, but just the place and position of Cornell Plantations within the college and across the university.

“So examining how effectively are we, as a unit, supporting the education, research and outreach missions of both the college and the university; and then, as a part of that, as a follow-up to that, determine whether our current name is fitting that mission and vision.

“So we hired a consultant to help us with this process. They ran a number of focus groups, which were targeted to faculty, to students, our donors, alumni, advisory council, among many others. So those were in December and January

of this year. And then from that, they developed a survey that went out to about 2,800 recipients.

“So from all of this, from focus groups and the survey, they based their recommendation that the name be changed on several points, many of which we already know and which Jeff has articulated; but first of all, I’ll just run through them briefly.

“In 1944, the name was changed from Cornell University Arboretum to Cornell Plantations, at the behest of Liberty Hyde Bailey. And he had this grand vision, both spatial and disciplinary, that would go all the way out to Mount Pleasant and Varna, and it would be larger than the university campus. And it was dealing not just with horticultural development or new varieties and cultivars, but also looking at livestock production, development of new livestock types and all the animal breeding and animal husbandry.

“So as Jeff says, it was really, if you look at that bigger idea, it really represents what CALS is, not what Cornell Plantations is. In any event, that big vision was never applied to Cornell Plantations. It was never realized, so that never happened, but the name did change.

“And then where Jeff talked about the agriculture context of what Plantations means, as well as the illusion in the minds of many to an unfortunate time in U.S. history of racial oppression and slavery, and it is confusing to many people. I

have had parents and others come to me and ask me what is Plantations. I have been introduced locally, even at various -- like the Rotary Club and others as the director of Cornell Orchards. So there's a disjunct between what Plantations is, as a name, and what we do as an organization. Then there's, as Jeff also eluded to, there's very weak support for the name with our advisory council, donors, members, alumni and others.

“So the long and short of it is that we have recommended to the dean that the name be changed to Cornell Botanic Gardens, and that has received broad support within the college from the dean and the associate deans. There's been an Employee Assembly resolution supporting this, Graduate and Professional Students Association resolution in support, the president's leadership team has heard the pitch and supports it, the Capital Funding and Priorities Committee supported it, the Buildings and Properties Committee of the board considered it in early September and supports it, and the CALS Faculty Senate also.

“So now we are here, and I believe that this changing the name to Cornell Plantations will have a number of effects. It will much more clearly identify us as a public garden with an arboretum, botanic gardens and natural areas, and will elude more to the broad diversity of plants that we manage and nurture and display and interpret for faculty, students and the public.

“I think we'll also open up new sources of philanthropic support. And in this day and age, I think that's very critical. And I think it may also set the stage for our 75th anniversary, which will be in 2019, to do a capital campaign to engage more alumni and donors about who we are and moving towards the future. I think ultimately it will give us better support and visibility and recognition throughout the college, the university and the community, and foster much greater public support.

“So I'll turn it over to Professor Collmer.”

Professor Alan Collmer, Plant Science: “Thank you, Christopher. My name is Alan Collmer, and I was asked by Beth Ahner to serve as a neutral party representing the protests. There were six written protests to the name change that were received by Christopher; and you have read one of them, I believe, from the student, William Stone. He published a very nice letter in the Cornell ["Daily Sun."](#) The others came from a combination of categories of visiting professors emeriti and alumni.

“I think I was asked to represent the protests because I've been, for two years ending June 2016, the director of the School of Integrated Plant Science, so I have sort of a broader perspective, I guess.

“The protests fall in three categories: Process, motivation and loss of heritage.

“There were protests that the survey was too long and it sort of indirectly built to the case for a name change, rather than sort of addressing it up front.

“There was concern about motivation being primarily political correctness.

“Regarding loss of heritage, there were two concerns: One is that there'd be a loss of a link to Liberty Hyde Bailey and his dream. The other is there would be a loss of heritage in losing the name itself. The name acquires a certain historical value, which will now be lost.

“You have already heard about Liberty Hyde Bailey's dream for sort of a larger enterprise that would sort of broadly fit into one of the broader definitions of Plantations; but in a sense, that was not achieved within the confines of the Plantations itself.

“Regarding the historical aspect with the name itself, it's inarguable there will be a bit of a less of historical value. People that met each other in the Plantations in 1974, you know, will have to sort of remember that the name has now changed; but that's pretty common.

“There is also the protest that the name, with its sort of quirky nature, makes it distinctive in the world of botanic gardens. And third concern is that the name botanic gardens itself does not include arboretum and natural areas and sort of suffers from the same problem that Plantations has.

"So those are the concerns, and I have a few things I'll say in a minute, but I want to stop and ask if there is anybody with whom these concerns resonate, so you have a chance to discuss it. Okay, yes. Please."

Senator Cynthia Bowman, Law School: "Why didn't you just go back to arboretum, since that was that historical name?"

Director Dunn: "Hi, Cynthia. The main reason is an arboretum is a type of botanic garden, so it's much more restrictive than botanic gardens themselves. So botanic gardens, and using the plural can include horticultural display gardens, can include an arboretum, the natural areas we manage as well, so botanic gardens is broader, rather than being restrictive.

"And I think it would be further confusing to go back to arboretum, because there is the F.R. Newman Arboretum, and that will be confusing, too, because then that won't refer to the broad diversity of holdings that we have."

Unidentified speaker: "May I just comment too? Also, I would say there are many botanic gardens that also have natural areas associated with them in Europe. And Missouri Botanic Garden in the United States has a large natural area associated, so it's not inappropriate to consider the broader sense of botanic gardens, including a lot of other things too."

Speaker Susskind: "Okay, anything else? Yes."

Senator Dan Brown, Animal Science. I was curious why you chose the archaic term botanic, rather than botanical. I mean, Skaneateles has an aerodrome up there for their airport, but the rest of the airports have been renamed airports. And botanic is a term you associate with really old institutions and gardens. Why don't you go all the way into the 21st Century?

“And the other point is Plantations also means a colony, which isn't any more attractive really to me, personally, than visions of –”

Director Dunn: “Yes, I agree with that second point. Thank you.

“To that first point, to me, botanical refers more to -- adjective that refers to something that eludes to plants, so it has some basic reference to them, rather than to the plants themselves.

“So if Alan were wearing a tie of a certain nature, I might say it's a very nice botanical print on that tie, but botanic refers more to the plants themselves. So to me, it's a better term to use.

“And it's not arcane in any way. The new Delaware Botanic Garden that was instituted in 2012 is the Delaware Botanic Garden. 2009, we have the San Diego Botanic Garden. The Tulsa Botanic Garden was founded in 2009. The University of Washington Botanic Garden, 2005.

"I can go down the list and show you all these brand new spanking botanic gardens that are all botanic gardens. And not to mention the U.S. Botanic Garden in Washington."

Speaker Susskind: "Anything else?"

Senator Thomas Björkman, Horticulture. "I represent the academic unit that the Plantations botanic gardens is associated with, and I just wanted to say that fellow faculty in the department support this move very much and, in fact, have different priorities, perhaps, but it's a point of pride to see how much Plantations has grown and expanded academically in the areas of service and the kinds of plant uses over the past 15, 20 years.

"So we're looking at this sort of as a recognizing that achievement by promoting it to a better name that brings it into the community of botanic gardens across the world."

Senator Doyle: "Okay, so if there are no other -- I have one thing I'd like to say to close, and that is with regard to Liberty Hyde Bailey's dream of this larger enterprise, and also honoring Liberty Hyde Bailey's heritage, the fact is the college and the Cornell University Experiment Station just made a large investment in a wonderful new and newly named Liberty Hyde Bailey Conservatory.

“It is a wonderful facility that celebrates plant diversity, especially the palms that he studied in the latter part of his life, and it's right on Tower Road. There is a big brass plaque that says Liberty Hyde Bailey Conservative instead of Purple Greenhouse Number 12 or whatever else it was before.

“And in the dead of winter, it's a great place to visit. And in it you will find brochures that lead you to other plant science destinations on campus that, in a sense, manifest Bailey's dream, but across the whole campus. The Weed Science Teaching Garden, the Crops of the World Garden, the Cornell Orchards and the Plantations were, as they're described here, Cornell's world-class botanic gardens, arboretum and natural areas.

“So I think Liberty Hyde Bailey is alive, despite -- his dream is alive, despite the change in the name.”

Director Dunn: “Just one more historical item. So getting back to the arboretum thing, it was Cornell University Arboretum from 1928 to 1944; but before that, President White issued a statute on October 21, 1875, in which he called for the university grounds to have a botanic garden. So we're actually honoring his vision that predated Liberty Hyde Bailey's.”

Speaker Susskind: “So without further ado, we'd like to call the question. We are going to do it by a hand vote. And only senators are allowed to vote; so if you are not a senator, you can't vote.

“So I will put up the resolution. Be it therefore resolved that the faculty senate encourages the board of trustees to approve the proposed name change of Cornell Plantations to Cornell Botanic Gardens at their October 2016 board meeting, so that Cornell's botanic gardens, arboretum and natural areas may be represented by a more relevant name, and thus reach broader audiences.

“That is it. Okay.

“So all in favor, show of hands. We have to count, so just bear with us.

“Yeah, I got roughly 48. Is that what you got, Charlie? Okay, good. Excellent.

“We are very scientific here.

“And all opposed?

“Abstained?

“Okay. Well, the resolution is accepted or passed. Good. Excellent.

“So now, without further ado, we have the College of Business leadership team here to answer some questions. We have set up some chairs in the front, so why don't you all come down. We have allocated the remainder of the meeting, which is 40 minutes, for you to present and then take questions. So thank you, and welcome.”

(APPLAUSE)

5. SENIOR LEADERSHIP FROM THE COLLEGE OF BUSINESS

Dean Soumitra Dutta, College of Business: “Good afternoon, everyone. My name is Soumitra. I am the dean of the College of Business, and I would like to thank you all for inviting us in to both share with you an update on how things are going, progressing, the creation of the new college, and also very important, get your feedback and suggestions, ideas, about how we can collectively, in fact, do it better in every possible way.

“I will make a few brief introductory comments, then I will request my colleagues to introduce themselves and also say a few comments themselves. So in my part of the commentary, I would like to make three points. The first one is we are all very aware that the birth of the College of Business was a difficult one. It was one that was often critiqued for not being consultative enough, not being inclusive enough.

“And what we have tried very, very hard is to be as inclusive and as consultative as possible in the process post-January 30th. You will hear some details of it from other commentary, but we have really tried very, very hard to include faculty, staff, alumni, other members, the stakeholder groups in the various deliberations about how to best create the College of Business.

“The second point I would like to make is, as we have gone through the process of creating the College of Business, there are always four questions on top of our

mind. And those four questions can be summarized very briefly as: Is it good for Cornell?

“So clearly, what we are trying to achieve has to enhance the image, reputation of Cornell as a top tier research university. Is what we are doing, will it help Cornell become a better university? Is it aligned with the mission of Cornell?

“The second question is: Is it good for our faculty, in terms of attracting, retaining, developing talent?

“The third question is: Is it good for our students, in making sure that we give them the best possible learning experience, the best possible opportunities, enable them as successful in the carriers and become great alumni later on.

“And the fourth and the last question is are we doing any harm; because it's very important for us that we have three excellent schools coming together, and we have to ensure that we do not cause any harm to any of the three schools. And rather, we try to enhance them in the best way possible and project the synergy in the best way possible.

“The third point I want to make is that we are also very aware that there are great business schools in this country and elsewhere, and our goal is not to become another copy cat business school. So it's not just larger, but it's really becoming distinctive, becoming better, and trying to do things that perhaps we could not do ourselves individually.

“And we can take numerous examples of that. Let me share with you one brief example. If you think about the business of food, traditionally the school of administration had tremendous strengths in both research, teaching and alumni, leadership in these areas; but now with the Dyson School, we have an enormously strong base of complementary faculty strengths and research, teaching and also alumni outreach. You bring these two elements together, and you have what is possible to create at Cornell what other schools cannot really create or copy.

“And that is just one example; but clearly, what we aspire towards is creating a business school, a College of Business that is able to leverage complementary strengths, not just inside the College of Business, but also outside, other sister schools at Cornell, Engineering, Arts and Sciences, Law and other schools, and really try and project the uniqueness of Cornell onto the College of Business.

“Now, I will now request my deputy dean and dear colleague Chris Barrett to make a few comments. Chris is responsible for all the academic affairs in the college, and he can talk to you more about the faculty aspects.”

Chris Barrett, Deputy Dean and Dean of Academic Affairs of the College of Business:

“Thank you, Soumitra. I am Chris Barrett, as Soumitra just mentioned, and let me just elaborate on a couple of Soumitra's points by elaborating somewhat on

the processes that followed the announcement of the College of Business and the trustee vote to create it.

“So there were seven committees that the provost convened, pulling together faculty, staff, students from especially across the three schools, but also drawing on other units, in CALS, as well as the central university administration. Those handled everything from undergraduate student matters, graduate student matters, staff synergy, et cetera.

“One of particular interest to this body is the Faculty Governance Committee, which worked out the architecture by which the faculty would integrate across the three schools, preserving the tenure homes in three schools; but how would we begin to pull faculty together who shared common scholarly interests taught in similar domains, et cetera.

“So Mike Fontaine very helpfully served on that committee. All of those six committees reported into a steering committee that Chris Schaffer kindly served on, and that steering committee approved the final design of the College of Business.

“So we then launched on July 1, having constituted in particular new areas, we have seven disciplinary areas that cut across the three schools. The faculty were asked to identify which area they preferred to belong to. So they self-identified, self-affiliated the faculty who affiliated with each area, that nominated

leadership they would like from within the faculty. From that, we identified seven area coordinators. They have been meeting with their faculty since they were named in the second half of June.

“These area coordinators have been now actively engaged in pulling together the life of the finance faculty together across three schools, the marketing faculty across the three schools, et cetera. Those seven area coordinators, along with the three school deans, comprise an Academic Planning Council, which together makes all the decisions around matters academic in the college.

“So we have been deliberating around everything from the first drafts of promotion and tenure guidelines, which are now out at the three schools, or talking through the creation of themes, which are to pull together faculty across areas, like perhaps the business of food.

“So the Academic Planning Council, comprised of these seven area coordinators and the three school deans, is really kind of the heart of academic decision-making. Parallel to that is an elected Faculty Policy Committee, which is now active with three elected members from each school, two tenure track, one non-tenure track. So they are to provide the faculty governance apparatus within the college. So they are to weigh in on all matters that the academic planning council weighs in on and advise the dean.

“Over these committees and a set of seven task forces that have been comprised to pursue more operational details around undergraduate admissions, how to manage centers and institutes, et cetera, there ever been more than 200 people engaged on these committees and task forces, more than 40% of them faculty within the three schools. So this is a highly participatory process now.

Sometimes painfully so, but highly participatory. We think that's generating good results, both in terms of keeping people informed, but also in helping to weed out bad ideas and to introduce good ideas that percolate up from all across the faculty in the three schools.

“The other thing that does is it helps us to make sure we are synchronizing on important matters like faculty hiring. And to offer just one example, because of the creation of the College of Business, we are able to really reinforce the point Soumitra just made about we're not looking to be a cookie cutter business school. The provost referred to it as not becoming Wharton North.

“In the Dyson School, three of the authorized faculty hires this year, two were in environmental economics, one in development economics. Those three positions justified in part because of the Dyson School's commitment to multidisciplinary majors within CALS, to the environmental and sustainability sciences major, where Dyson bears responsibility for the environmental and economics

instruction, that indeed the concentration and the international agricultural and rural development major, which likewise Dyson is a major contributor towards.

“And our faculty, we're aging and retiring in those areas, so Dyson needed investment in those traditional areas. We embrace that, because it helps to differentiate the College of Business from our peer elite business schools. We aspire to be a different kind of business school, one that really helps to reflect Cornell and the things that make this a distinctive research university in the world of business schools.

“And part of how we do that is through very robust engagement with the Faculty Policy Committee, with these seven areas, and the Academic Planning Council that really is driving so much of how we are developing as a college body.

“So with that, let me pass it to Kate Walsh, the interim dean of School of Hotel Administration.”

Interim Dean Kath Walsh, School of Hotel Administration: “Thank you, Chris. You just identified me, introduced me. I am on the management faculty at the School of Hotel Administration. Hello, everyone. And I have been on the faculty for 16 years, and this July 1st assumed the role of interim dean for a two-year period of time.

“I don't know if you've actually heard about any Hotel School faculty speaking up or being grumpy about this process, but what I would like to do is share with you a little bit about what we see are some really wonderful opportunities for us as part of this College of Business, share with you one or two concerns that have popped up, and of course, address any questions you might have about our faculty or alumni, who have been quite vocal in this process.

“To build on Soumitra's point, we really see this as very good for us, as faculty. I know you'll find this hard to believe, but our faculty are across the street from Johnson, and we never go across the street. You are all collaborating with faculties at other buildings, I know, but we never did. And so this opportunity to actually form engagements, discussions around research with faculty in our disciplines at the other two sister schools has been fabulous. That is the best part of this, is to just see the dialogue that bubbles up, the potential for research collaborations in ways we've never talked about before, even three months in.

“We see wonderful opportunities for programming. We are a small school of over 60 faculty. 40 or so are tenure track. We just don't have the skill to do some of the things we would love to do to deepen our industry ties and really support our mission of creating and disseminating knowledge for the hospitality industry broadly defined. So we see wonderful opportunities in both teaching and

research to leverage the strengths of the other two schools, analytics and, of course, the text base come to mind as one really key one.

“Another thing that's just really top of our mind that we're paying attention to is the admissions process, because the School of Hotel Administration is relatively small, and so how do we generate greater awareness for who we are as a school. And we're already noticing triple the amount of attendance in our information sessions, just by virtue of saying we're talking about business at Cornell, for both the School of Hotel Administration and Dyson.

“And we are really excited to see how that's going to strengthen, widen our applicant pool, at least with our ED and especially with our regular decision applicants. And we think there's going to be some wonderful gains there.

“A few of the concerns that have popped up is because we're a specialized school with a distinct mission, I get a lot of questions; how do we actually centralize and coordinate without homogenizing, how do we make sure research prestige for Cornell Business is enhanced, while at the same time enhancing what we do, because we have really deep industry connections and ties. We ask our faculty to get very engaged in that as part of our measures of excellence, and so we're really paying attention to that going forward, to Soumitra's point of how we do no harm.

“So that's what a lot of the concerns have popped up with faculty; how do we grow and strengthen who we are, building from our distinct mission, but also as part of this larger College of Business, where both goals are really strongly met. That's the same conversation I'm having with many alums. And when they hear about our ideas, they get truly excited. It is just literally getting the opportunity to share that with them.

“So we're excited. There's a lot of wonderful things on the horizon for us, and probably the best part is these conversations and collaborations and opportunity to work with colleagues at our two other schools, as part of this college.

“So thank you. I'm going to turn that over to --.”

Dean Mark Nelson, Johnson Graduate School of Management: “Thanks, Kate.

So I'm Mark Nelson, and I'm dean at Johnson. I am entering my 27th year here at Cornell; 26 years proudly as a faculty member, and now I've gone over to the dean side.

“It is interesting when Kate talks about not crossing the street. We have the same thing, except we'd cross the street because the food was a lot better at Hotel, but what we weren't doing is interacting with each other as colleagues. And so what the College of Business is doing is providing a coordination mechanism for us to do that a lot better.

“Near-term, the benefits have been just simply things like cooperation, making it easier for our students to be able to take courses at Hotel or at Dyson, us offering accounting courses for students in Dyson or Hotel or, for example, Dyson offering a tax course that otherwise our students couldn't take. These are things that used to be very, very difficult to pull off, and now it's a lot easier to pull off.

“A broader way that this kind of increased access to people is helping us is that it's helping us offer programming that we didn't used to be able to offer. So in particular, this next fall, we're going to be offering an MPS program with a specialization in accounting. This is something that we talked about for a long time in Johnson, and we just didn't have the people to do it. We weren't CPA-focused enough. We were more focused on MBA education. We had some of the courses, but not all of them.

“It turns out that Dyson has a very good undergraduate CPA-oriented program that we have been assisting with in recent years. And when you put the three schools together in the sense of cooperating a lot more, it makes it easier to offer this program; and therefore, meet the demands of our students.

“So our faculty was excited about this. We voted overwhelmingly in favor -- our Policy Committee voted in favor, and now we're going to be launching a program that has -- it's a faculty lead, a Dyson faculty member. It's offered as a graduate program out of Johnson, but it has teaching out of all three schools.

“So it is an example of ways we can serve our students, where it used to be these folks would be going to another program to get a one-year masters and meet the requirements to be able to sit for the CPA exam. It also has positive spillovers for other students that aren't going after an accounting degree, but are interested in that kind of coursework. That is just an example of the way the cooperation is helping us from a curriculum standpoint.

“Long-run, I see benefits from a hiring perspective, I see benefits from the student placement perspective and, across these areas, the opportunities for increased scholarly interaction are really exciting. So all that's good.

“When I'm thinking about concerns, once again, when we are talking about faculty bandwidth, this process has been very inclusive of faculty that Chris was describing, which means that we all have many, many opportunities to attend meetings. It is wonderful. And in particular, it falls disproportionately on a set of faculty that are kind of at this mid-career level or somewhat advanced career level, where they're kind of the ones you go to to take on leadership positions and have the best interests of the school and the college at heart. So I think there are some people that have been bearing an administrative burden over the past several months, and we're looking for that to diminish, as all these decisions get made and kind of processes get nailed down.

“The other thing, just to pick up on a point that Kate made, and really that Chris was talking about, is that these task forces are very focused on do no harm. And in particular, we are concerned that we are really careful with the student service-facing ones.

“So things like registrar, things like placement, we want to make sure we handle that really carefully, because we had our own individual ways of doing that, and there are ways that we can help each other, but we don't want to disrupt those processes in a way that could be harmful to students. So that's something that simply means we have to move very deliberately and very carefully.

“With that, Ed?”

Interim Dean Ed McLaughlin, Dyson School of Management: “Thanks, Mark. I am Ed McLaughlin, the interim dean at Dyson. I have been here 33 years.

During that whole time, I was on committees at Hotel and Johnson, and I gave seminars, attending seminars, but I must admit, they sort of remained what Kate and Mark said; they were silos down the hill somewhere that I didn't really understand very well.

“And I'll just make three quick points, because my colleagues have covered a lot of the ground: Students, faculty and land grant. The student opportunity for increased access to courses has really impressed me. When I first heard about the creation of the new college, I sort of scratched my head and said well, don't

students have access to courses all over the place now? I mean, what's changed? Indeed, yes, they did before, but we have made it so much easier now and there's a rationale and reason for faculty members to make it happen and for students to take courses across colleges.

“So Mark mentioned the accounting example. One of our faculty in Dyson is teaching MBAs and undergraduates in accounting. A couple of good examples next semester, one of the Johnson MBA marketing faculty is teaching customer relationships management, a special section for Dyson students, and the same thing in entrepreneurship, a new course in management technology that one of the Johnson faculty is offering, opening up a new section in Dyson. Could that have happened before? Theoretically, sure, but it just never happened. I have been here 33 years and it never happened.

“On the faculty side, I think Soumitra mentioned an area that's really near to my heart, because my personal area of research is marketing in the food system, particular retailing, and we are really excited working with some colleagues in the other schools to develop some sort of theme that differentiates Cornell from every other conventional cookie cutter business school, because we have expertise all the way up and down the supply chain and across the supply chain in food, starting from agriculture production to supply chain management, to wholesaling and retailing. We understand the food service part, we understand

the consumer part, and there isn't any other school that can boast those qualities, and we think we have an opportunity to make a lot more of that.

“Final point on students is we've got a minor that impacts students around the university. This was not created with the CCB, but it's already enhanced. We went from zero students four years ago.

“We now have 1,600 students minoring in business; 8,400 students, special Dyson minor for engineers; a couple hundred Dyson minor for Life Sciences; and 1,000 students, the majority of whom come from Arts and Sciences, who are picking up a minor in business, allowing those students to continue to major in a strong liberal arts curriculum, but at the same time, having something that they can argue and they could argue with their parents, in some cases, that they've got another set of skills, in some cases might be more job-ready.

“I will also say one thing about the Dyson School commitment, if you will, to the land grant legacy. Many questions have been raised: Will CALS students and students around the university still have access to our courses? Not only is the answer yes, but we think we're going to be able to offer more and smaller sections of courses with increased access to faculty around the three schools.

“So Kathryn Boor, the dean of CALS, as you know, and I, spent some time in Albany with the director of the farm bureau, with the commissioner of agricultural markets, with the governor's office, reconfirming our commitment to

the land grant system. Chris has mentioned the first three faculty members that we're searching for.

“When the governor's office asked me well, yes, we know you have a commitment to that now, but what is it going to look like in 20, 30 years; I have to give the honest answer, I don't know what it's going to look like in 30 years, but I will tell you, the first three faculty members we are investing in are 30-year investments to supporting the land grant mission.

“We have also taken two other steps. We have an undergraduate -- Dyson School advisory school that serves the whole school, about 45 or 50 members. We've just added five new members from our Agribusiness Advisory Council that serves the College of Agriculture in general to that council as a standing committee. It is a standing commitment to our land grant mission.

“And finally, we've changed the title of what was formerly director of extension in the Dyson School to director of land grant programs. And the idea is land grant mission is not something specific to Dyson. Cornell is the land grant university, and we have a commitment much broader than just the several faculty members who have extension appointments, to continuing our commitment to that land grant legacy. Soumitra?”

Dean Dutta: “Yeah, so I will maybe conclude the comment from all of us by saying that creating a college, a new college in an Ivy League institution is not

easy. It is a lot of hard work, a lot of heavy lifting, and it's a collective endeavor. And none of this would be possible without great leadership and great colleagues.

“And I'm very grateful to my colleagues who are here in front of the auditorium today who are leading different important roles, plus other colleagues who are area coordinators in other leadership positions inside the institution, because without the collective support and leadership, nothing of this would have been possible.

“And I know there's a lot more that remains to be done, so we are just a little past 100 days into the birth of the new college, but I am proud that we have made some very good progress, and I think a lot of steps to be taken; but together, with your support and your guidance, I'm confident that we can reach the goals that we set out for at the initial start of the project.

“Very happy to take some questions, as they might arise.”

Senator Ted Clark, Microbiology and Immunology: “Can you just remind us whether there is currently or contemplated a degree program, a major in business through this entity?”

Dean Dutta: “So there are degree programs offered in undergraduate in Dyson and School of Hotel Administration, and they will remain as they are.”

Senator Clark: “A major for undergraduates in business through the combined—”

Dean Dutta: “No. So the programs remain with the schools and the programs essentially, the undergraduate majors will remain as they are.”

Senator Ricard Miller, Philosophy: “Dick Miller, Philosophy. My question about potential harm comes from an aspect of discussions promoted by the College of Business initiative that's different from the collaborative discussions that I appreciate.

“The top-down nature of this initiative has, among other things, created a toxic environment in which people involved, for example, in development economics and related fields at Cornell, if they are not tenured, also often feel fearful of speaking out. If they are tenured, don't want to be people who it's dangerous to know.

“Speaking with them, speaking with other people involved in developing economics and related fields at Cornell and elsewhere, there is a do no harm fear.

“It is connected with the widespread pressure at Cornell towards increased emphasis on entrepreneurship at Cornell Tech and the College of Business proposal in the building boom in entrepreneurship-related buildings, which in the College of Business context means that the place of work on development, which has no real relationship to entrepreneurship, say, on what happens when people in the countryside move to the cities in the course of development, as they do in a partly destructive, partly productive process; work on the impact of

globalization, good, bad or one doesn't know, that may contribute nothing to entrepreneurship.

“Those central intellectual enterprises, which have been stimulated by work at the Dyson School, people believe and I believe are endangered by the College of Business. If I were senior faculty at Dyson, I would not know my place. If I was thinking of applying to Dyson, I would wonder about my place, if I was in one of those situations.

“I haven't heard anything about protecting the independent role of these studies unrelated to entrepreneurship in a College of Business, and I'd like to.”

Deputy Dean Barrett: “I am happy to take that, since I am a development economist at the Dyson School. I very much share your concerns, Dick. Indeed, that's part of why I embrace the College of Business. I am the last hire that the Dyson School made in 1998 from a search in development economics. We're running a search now for development economics. We are able to do that because the College of Business financial arrangements liberate Dyson to be able to invest its surplus in an area where we sorely need new talent, because I'm not that young anymore.

“This is a really important area. I work with small farmers in the developing world in relatively remote areas of Africa, and they see themselves as entrepreneurs, and they unfortunately aren't very well-served right now by

governments in especially Ethiopia. Those of you who know what's taking place there, government's not always their friend. So the private sector, with all of its warts, is actually seen as an agent of development, giving them some opportunities.

“Many of us have worked very closely with NGOs and with businesses and with governments. I don't see a problem, actually, with a business school-based economics program. Some of the very best talent these days in development economics is getting hired by our peers. MIT's development economists are getting hired in Sloan. Harvard's are getting hired in HBS. That is the way business schools are going. They see the developing world as a huge part of the future, both for consumers and for work force, and they realize they need to understand those contexts, because it's not like Wall Street. It's very much not like Wall Street.

“So I obviously deeply share your concern, Dick, because this is my own research program. My career has been dedicated to precisely these issues. And the reality is, the only way we're getting to invest in that is through the College of Business, because we hadn't been investing in it for quite some time.”

Dean Nelson: “I will just add a postscript to what Chris said, and that is we have a search committee composed for the development economist position of faculty members from across the CCB, the three schools, and the chair is a senior

development economist in Dyson. The position will just be voted on formally, I think, Friday this week, but we've been working informal network already. And the chair of the search committee projects over 200 applications for this job. So I think the interest level from development exists from around the world is still very high in the Dyson School. It's a projection, but it looks pretty favorable."

Dean Dutta: "If you allow me just one comment, it's not just a question of small businesses and small entrepreneurs. I think even big business and emerging markets need to have a very strong social dimension. I come originally from India. And India, if you want to set up a plant or any kind of manufacturing enterprise, the company has to present a social plan for how will the company invest social development in the entire region, which includes setting up hospital, setting up schools, roads, infrastructure and a whole bunch of social mechanisms.

"So I think even business leaders today, whole range of businesses, to survive, to be effective, successful and competitive, they have to include those dimensions. That's the thing, something that we can be particularly strong in."

Senator Thomas Bjorkman, Horticulture: "So I have a question on impact on other college finances, and specifically for CALS. It has been clear for a number of decades now that philanthropy is going to have a larger part of the college budget, alumni giving. And in recognition of that, I think development in the

college for 20 years at least have been focusing particularly on Dyson School undergraduates, for fairly obvious reasons.

“So the philanthropy from them should be peaking 15 or 20 years from now. So if that money all ends up going to the College of Business, it's great investment over the decades from CALS, a wise effort to maintain financing into the coming decades will come to naught and CALS will be in really tough straits, as far as I can tell.

“I don't have inside knowledge. That is just an outsider looking at it, but I wonder how you are dealing with that fairly substantial issue.”

Dean Dutta: “I am not sure I'm qualified to comment on that, because I don't have visibility into CALS' finances. The provost is here. He could probably best speak about the CALS' finances.”

Provost Michael Kotlikoff: “Let me just make one point about that. So I think you raise a very good point, and it's been raised by others. The philanthropy of Dyson alumni and graduates can be and we expect will be restricted to Dyson, or in large part be directed towards Dyson.

“Dyson is in CALS. It remains in CALS. It is a part of the College of Business as well, but the faculty are CALS faculty, students are CALS students. So I don't see this as a zero-sum issue. I think if that philanthropy goes to continue to support

Dyson, as it likely would from alumni if this had never happened, that improves CALS, improves Cornell and improves College of Business. That is the idea.”

Dean Dutta: “Do you have any suggestion for us about things we could take particular note of? Because I think it's very important we get feedback from faculty colleagues across the university. There is a good chance for us to get your feedback too.

“Thank you so much.

(APPLAUSE)

“We are very happy to come back in a few months' time, if you would like to listen to us once again. Thank you.”

Speaker Susskind: “Well, without further ado, that concludes our meeting for today. Meeting adjourned.”